

# **The Particularities of the Monologue Speech Type Manifestations in Stuttering Schoolchildren with Tatar-Russian Bilingualism Compared to the Normality**

Marina P. Osipovskaya, Kadriya Sh. Sharifzyanova & Zalfira I. Zamaletdinova  
*Kazan (Volga region) Federal University, RUSSIA*

•Received 03 January 2016 •Revised 10 March 2016 •Accepted 19 March 2016

---

Actuality of studying of an issue on specific manifestations of a monologue speech type in bilingual schoolchildren with stutter has been stipulated by the necessity of elaboration of a constituent concept on central mechanisms underlying this kind of communication disorder, on the nature of disturbances of speech formation mechanisms in the stuttering with bilingualism, as well as due to absence of trials on the influence of bilingualism upon the process of construction of textual reports and outer manifestations of stutter in children, speaking both Tatar and Russian languages. In this respect, the goal of this article is implied in revelation of particularities of a full and consistent monologue expression in stuttering schoolchildren, brought up and educated under the conditions of Tatar-Russian bilingualism, in comparison with the normality (children without stutter). As a result of speech production studying, we revealed both common (for all the stuttering schoolchildren with bilingualism) and specific (for the different kinds of native language speakers) principles for the construction of full and consistent monologue expressions. The principles can be followed depending on the level of evolvement of each of the lingual systems, that, in turn, is of special importance for occurrence of frequency and severity of the cases with stutter. Materials of this article should be helpful for tutors of higher educational establishments, young scientists and scientific researchers, as well as speech therapists of preschool establishments and schools, teachers of primary schools.

**Keywords:** stutter, bilingualism, full and consistent monologue expression, the speech particularities in stuttering schoolchildren with Tatar-Russian bilingualism

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **The relevance of the research problem**

Nowadays the problem of positive or negative influence of bilingualism on the development of speech of the child is controversial and widely debated (Chirsheva

Correspondence: Marina P. Osipovskaya,  
Kazan (Volga region) Federal University, 18 Kremlyovskaya Street, 420008, Kazan,  
RUSSIA  
E-mail: osipovskaya-m@mail.ru  
doi: 10.12973/ijese.2016.362a

© Author(s)

Originally published by Look Academic Publishers in IJESE (ISSN: 1306-3065)

2012; Van Borsel, Maes & Foulon, 2001; Eichler, Jansen & Müller 2013; Cantone 2013; Ezeizabarrena 2013; Meisel, 2013). A large number of authors noted an increasing risk of stuttering in children in learning of second language (Belyakova & Dyakova, 1998; Eisenson, 1984; Karniol, 1992).

Epidemiological information presented earlier by the authors (Travis, Johnson & Shover, 1937; Stern, 1948) indicates to the prevalence of speech disorders in bilinguals; there is an assumption that stuttering is most common among those children, with whom parents used two languages from birth (Au-Yeung, Charles & Davis, 2000).

Until the present, there is no complete idea about the central mechanisms of stuttering, about the nature of violation of mechanisms of speech production in stammering. However, increasingly relevant problem in the study of speech behavior of bilinguals with stuttering and those natural and regular difficulties experienced by stutterers in the process of construction of coherent monologue speech in the conditions of bilingualism. The few domestic studies of connected speech of stuttering indicate to the existence of peculiar characteristics of intra-speech programming associated not only with speech fluency disorders of convulsive nature, but also with the process of lexical search tools (Levin, 1963; Dyakov, 1991; Saitbayeva, 1991).

In literature available to us there are no instructions on the special researches devoted to the study of influence of bilingualism on the process of creation of the detailed monologue speech in stuttering, and also on external manifestations of stutter. At the same time, scientific search in this direction will allow to expand theoretical understanding of stutter mechanisms and by that to make the help at stuttering more effective.

### **Scientific novelty, theoretical and practical importance of research**

Scientific novelty of research is as follows:

- revealed, that children of primary school age studied in Tatar classes of general education of Russian schools identify different types of a bilingualism;
- obtained new data of the influence of bilingualism on the process of creation of coherent speech in stuttering of schoolchildren-bilinguals;
- revealed the dependence of external manifestations of stuttering from the level of proficiency of second language.

Theoretical significance of research:

- expanded theoretical concepts about the features of construction of monologue speech in stuttering of schoolchildren with bilingualism;
- identified correlations between type of bilingualism and features of connected speech, and also violations of smoothness of speech of schoolchildren-bilinguals with stuttering ;
- found that one of the important conditions of speech disorders in stuttering (convulsive stuttering) is the difficulty of actualization of the words, which are enhanced by the necessity of choosing one of two lexical equivalents belonging to different language systems.

Practical significance of the research consists in the development of parameters of assessment of the level of recitative development and typological characteristics of students-bilinguals; on the basis of theoretical thesis and results of research and conclusions based the principles of differentiated correctional and pedagogical work directed on training of stuttering schoolchildren in creation of monologue speech in native and in second (Russian) language taking into account the type of bilingualism.

## **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

### **Brief characteristics of investigated group of children**

An experimental study was made in Tatar classes of secondary Russian schools in Kazan city. In total 154 children at the age of 9-10 years (pupils of the third and fourth classes) using Tatar and Russian languages in the course of communication were examined.

As a result of preliminary examination of schoolchildren it was revealed that 89 schoolchildren had Russian language as dominant in all spheres of communication; these children didn't know monologue speech in Tatar, therefore, they could not be included in the experimental group for making tasks in work.

Thus, in the experimental group were included 46 normal speakers and 19 school children with stuttering, the language of family communication was mainly Tatar language. All of them were qualified by the specialists as children with safe eyesight and hearing and normal intellectual development.

A survey of bilingual children was in Russian and Tatar languages, which contributed not only to establish the parameters of smoothness of speech, but also an adequate assessment of the linguistic skills of bilinguals.

### **Content and structure of study**

The aim of this experimental study was to identify the characteristics of the coherent monologue speech of schoolchildren with stuttering, who are brought up and trained in the conditions of a bilingualism in comparison with norm was the purpose of experimental studying. According to the purpose and objectives the contents and structure of research were defined.

The experiment consisted of three stages.

At the first stage of speech therapy examination of the choosing contingent of younger schoolchildren for the purpose of establishment of age of development of second (Russian) language, the level of proficiency of Tatar and Russian languages, and also for the purpose of an exception of other speech disorders was conducted.

At the second stage examination of the speech of the studied children for detection of typological features of bilingualism was conducted. Methods of questioning of schoolchildren, conversations with children, their parents and teachers were used.

The type of native speakers is established on the basis of classification of types of bilingualism:

Type I – native speakers of coordinative language systems (one-level) profile;

Type II – native speakers of subordinative language systems (multi-level) profile;

Type III – native speakers of the elements of the second language system.

This typology is built with the following options: intra subject potential of use of secondary language system; intra subject of relation of two linguistic systems and degree of autonomy of their functioning.

With the aim of identifying of features of monologue speech of schoolchildren-bilinguals with stuttering at the third was carried out with normal comparative psycholinguistic analysis of texts-stories created by children in Tatar and Russian languages.

The text of artwork, literary and interlinear translations of the text original in Tatar language was used. As a result of preliminary processing in the text semantic pieces were distinguished, and made detailed predicative scheme in Russian and Tatar languages representing its semantic program (all levels of predicative structure) in the form of visual-graphic writing.

The following indicators of characterizing features of representing of artwork by children bilinguals were distinguished: features of organization of semantic program and structural linguistic processing, and also indicators of the external temporary organization of reproduced text messages.

In the process of checking of retelling texts of schoolchildren-bilinguals with normal speech and stuttering, related to different types of native speakers, taking into account contrastive feature of Tatar and Russian languages, which has contributed to the existence of interference phenomena in the structure of reproduced texts (by "interference" was understood the transformation of norms of native language into Russian language in the process of speech producing).

## RESULTS

### **The analysis of the results of experimental studies of features of monologue speech of stuttered schoolchildren with bilingualism in comparison with the norm**

Speech therapy examination and analysis of the results allowed to divide all examined children with normal speech and stuttering on "early" and "middle" bilinguals depending on the age of mastering of second (Russian) language. Those children who began to study Russian language in situations of natural communication from 1 to 6 years were classified as "early" bilingual; children's bilingual, who started to study Russian language from 7 years in educational terms, belonged to "middle".

For all examined schoolchildren with bilingualism has been identified unequal level of proficiency in second (Russian) language during the proficiency of Tatar language within the age norm. All schoolchildren with normal speech and stuttering were classified as three different types of speakers. Thus, to study the characteristics of monologue speech of students-bilinguals have been defined the following experimental groups:

To the first type were belonged 24 people with normal speech and 8 stuttering children with "early" bilingualism, which has found good proficiency of coherent speech in Tatar and Russian languages, when free transition from one language to another (*coordinative bilingualism*) were carried out.

To the second type were belonged 16 children with normal speech and stutters 6 stuttering schoolchildren – "early" bilinguals who had sufficient knowledge of connected speech in Tatar and Russian languages. However, Russian speech of schoolchildren was characterized by the presence of interference errors in phonetic, lexical-semantic, grammatical and syntactic levels (*subordinative bilingualism*).

To the third type were belonged 6 schoolchildren without speech pathologies and 5 stuttering children with "middle" bilingualism (who started to study Russian language at school), whose level of proficiency in monologue speech in Tatar language corresponded to the age norm, while the connected speech in Russian language had significant difficulties. Russian speech of children had strong influence of grammatical system of native language; this was reflected in the specific errors due to the presence of interlingua interference (*the bearers of the elements of the secondary language system*).

Experimental study of monologue speech in stuttering schoolchildren in comparison with specific data standards allowed to identify general and specific for each of three types of speakers regularities to create more complex monologue speech.

The results of the experiment showed that retellings of all stuttering pupils in each of two languages were different with less lexical diversity and the increasing

number of inadequate to the context of lexical substitutions in comparison with the norm. It is important to note, that external temporary implementation of message stuttering schoolchildren-bilinguals was characterized by the increasing in the number of long pauses, which may reflect difficulties of choice of language means adequate to the purpose of speech. In terms of bilingualism, the process of expanded production of monologue speech of schoolchildren with stuttering, related to different types of native speakers, had specific characteristics which were evident when writing semantic text, and in the process of structural language processing and temporary implementation of external speech.

The obtained data showed that stuttering schoolchildren with *coordinative bilingualism* as their normal-speaking coevals, made the programming of the monologue and its constituent parts *in Tatar and Russian languages* very well, practically without disorder of sequence in the transmission of semantic movement of the speech. However, children of this group experienced difficulties connected with the structural-linguistic realization of the utterance in both mother tongue and second language (Russian) that arose as a result of the search for an adequate lexical unit for expressing thoughts.

Stuttering children with *subordinative bilingualism* was available to programming of the whole text as a speech *in Tatar and Russian languages*. At the same time in Russian language texts were observed violation of speech of schoolchildren, errors in the implementation of the operations of choosing lexical units, during the making of interphrase communication, logical and grammatical incompleteness of phrases, which testified about disorder on different levels in the process of speech production.

The phenomena of semantic and grammatical interference increased "failures" in different levels of speech production. We can assumed that insufficient opposition of mechanisms of production of texts, which are consistently belonging to two language systems in the bilinguals' mind - a real source of interference; therefore, *bilingualism* may be a factor that *contributes to the disorganization of coherent speech in stuttering children not only on motor, but also at higher levels of internally-speech programming*.

Students-bilinguals with stuttering – *the bearers of the elements of the second language system* was available for programming of the whole text as a whole speech and the meaning of each segment included in the text only *in their native language*. Children in this group had significant difficulties in the programming process of full monologue speech *in second language (Russian)*:

- there was a decline in the stability of speech intentions, component "core", "focus" of textual organization of speech;
- the system of plans and programs which organize text components in semantic whole (hierarchy of predicates) wasn't implemented.

Though these children could realize some simplified programs and knew a wide range of the studied replications: the used lexicon was significantly limited; in their text messages circulated simplified speech structures are similar in both languages according to their grammatical rules.

As a result of the study, it was established that the type of bilingualism significantly influences on the frequency of manifestation of stuttering in children:

- at the coordinative bilingualism the number of convulsive stuttering speech are equal in the speech of Tatar and Russian languages;
- at subordinative bilingualism mixing of linguistic subsystems, and challenges of actualization of the words, which increase with the necessity of choosing one of two lexical equivalents belonging to different language systems, contribute to the strengthening of the external manifestations of stuttering in Russian language speech.

- the proficiency of the elements of the second language system, that is, there is a tendency of reducing the frequency of convulsive stuttering in the initial stages of development of Russian language; improved smoothness of speech in Russian language is observed in a short period of time, during the period of basic statements and is associated with increasing control over the process of creation of the simplified program of the statement.

## DISCUSSION

It is known that stuttering in bilinguals can occur during verbal communication in one or two languages in equal or in various degrees. If at the initial stages of studying of second (Russian) language there is a tendency of reduction in the frequency of convulsive stuttering speech, which is probably connected with the strengthening of any control over the semantic side of speech, in process of acquisition by the child of linguistic experience of manifestation of stutter is increasing, what with the obvious evidence showing the results of a study of children with coordinative bilingualism.

For stuttering children bilingualism can be confounding factor, the mixing of linguistic subsystems in the production process of coherent speech and also the difficulties connected with a choice of one of two lexical equivalents favoring to strengthening of external manifestations of stutter.

## CONCLUSION

Thus, the article presents the results of the research which allows to make the following conclusions:

The stuttering schoolchildren of Tatar nationality who are studying in Tatar classes of secondary Russian schools and learners of Russian as second language, know the native language within the age norm. However, their coherent speech in Tatar language is characterized with convulsive stuttering and difficulties associated with the choice of language means adequate to the purpose of speech.

Different levels of Russian language proficiency is shown in the course of production of full monologue speech: while making the semantic of the program, its structural and language processing and the implementation of temporary external speech.

The stuttering students, bilinguals require special training of monologue speech as a mother tongue, in particular, in second (Russian) language with the use of individual techniques of correctional and pedagogical influence, taking into account typological peculiarities of bilingualism.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The work is performed according to the Russian Government Program of Competitive Growth of Kazan Federal University.

## REFERENCES

- Au-Yeung, J., Howell, P., Davis, S., Charles, N., & Sackin, S. (2000). UCL survey on bilingualism and stuttering. *Paper presented at the 3<sup>rd</sup> World congress on Fluency Disorders*, Nyborg, Denmark, 7-11 August 2000, from [http:// www.speech.psychol.ucl.ac.uk/survey1/PAPER/ifpaper.html](http://www.speech.psychol.ucl.ac.uk/survey1/PAPER/ifpaper.html).
- Belyakova, L.I., Dyakova, E. A. (1998). Stuttering. Moscow: V. Sekachev, 304.
- Cantone, K. F. (2013). Comments on the paper Gender acquisition in bilingual children: French-German, Italian-German, Spanish-German and Italian-French. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 17 (3), 573-576.

- Chircheva, G. N. (2012). The role of input in the process of formation of children's balanced bilingualism. *Abstracts of III International conference "Problems of formation of balanced bilingualism"*. St. Petersburg, 102-106.
- Dyakova, E. A. Speech errors and peculiarities of the process of speech formation in stuttering. In: *L.I. Belyakova(Eds.), Stuttering: theory and practice*. Moscow: Prometey, 38-50.
- Eichler, N., Jansen, V., & Müller, N. (2013). Gender acquisition in bilingual children: French–German, Italian–German, Spanish–German and Italian–French. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 17 (3), 550-572.
- Eisensohn, J. (1984). Stuttering as an expression of inefficient language development. In: *L. J. Raphael, C.B.Raphael, & M.R.Vasovinos (Eds.), Language and cognition: essays in honor of Arthur Bronstein*. New York: Plenum, 59-72.
- Ezeizabarrena, M.-J. (2013). Commentary on Larrañaga & Guijarro-Fuentes's The linguistic competence of early Basque–Spanish bilingual children and a Spanish monolingual child. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 17 (3), 602-606.
- Karniol, R. (1992). Stuttering out of bilingualism. *First Language*, 12, 255-283.
- Levin, R. E. (1963). On the Genesis of stuttering children with the development of the communicative functions of speech. *A Symposium on stuttering in children*. Moscow, 3-8.
- Meisel, J. M. (2013). Remarks on the acquisition of Basque–Spanish bilingualism. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 17 (3), 392-399.
- Saitbayeva, E. R. (1992). The Connected speech of stuttering schoolchildren 6-7 years: *Auto abstract dis. candidate of ped. sciences*. Moscow, 16.
- Stern, E. (1948). A preliminary study of bilingualism and stuttering in four Johannesburg schools. *Journal of Logopaedics*, 1, 15-25.
- Travis, L.E., Johnson, W., & Shover, J. (1937). The relation of bilingualism to stuttering. *Journal of Speech Disorders*, 2, 185-189.
- Van Borsel, J., Maes E., & Foulon, S. (2001). Stuttering and Bilingualism: A Review. *Journal of Fluency Disorders*, 26, 179-205.

